

# SUBMITTED BY THE DOMESTIC VIOLENCE INTERVENTION PROJECT'S SUBCOMMITTEE ON DOMESTIC HOMICIDE

# LAURA BAER STATE ATTORNEY'S OFFICE COMMITTEE CHAIR

# **COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

LORETTA BRIENZA, SALVATION ARMY ANDY MORGAN, JACKSONVILLE SHERIFF'S OFFICE DEBRA RUHLMAN, STATE ATTORNEY'S OFFICE ELLEN SILER, HUBBARD HOUSE, INC.

all the conservation of the contract of the co

The 1998 Domestic Mortality Review Report was sponsored by the Domestic Violence Intervention Project Committee (DVIP).

### 1998 DVIP COMMITTEE CHAIRPERSON

Shauna Wright, State Attorney's Office

### 1998 DVIP COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Judge Roberto Arias, County Court Division

Laura Baer, State Attorney's Office

Delores Battenelli, Clerk of the Court's Office

Noreen Blount, Clerk of the Court's Office

Loretta Brienza, Salvation Army

Clemente J. Inclan, State Attorney's Office

Brian J. Maxson, Hubbard House

Sandi McDermott, Mayport Family Advocacy Program

Andy Morgan, Jacksonville Sheriff's Office

Beverly Parker, Jacksonville Area Legal Aid, Inc.

Gail Patin, Hubbard House

Debra Ruhlman, State Attorney's Office

Ellen Siler, Hubbard House

Gail Wainwright, Clerk of the Court's Office

Judge David Wiggins, Family Law Division

# **COMMITTEE GOALS**

The Domestic Mortality Review Subcommittee was formed by Jacksonville's Domestic Violence Intervention Project to study domestic homicides occurring in Jacksonville in 1997. The purpose of the initial study was to examine these homicides to determine if our community could have helped to prevent these homicides. The project was continued in 1998 and an analysis was conducted including the domestic homicides outlined in the prior study.

The following report outlines the facts of the thirteen domestic homicides which occurred in 1998 and tracks patterns by evaluating specific information on a yearly basis. Finally, this report provides for a consideration of trends by examining all 22 domestic homicides occurring between December 1, 1997, and November 30, 1998.

# **FACTORS REVIEWED**

In order to look at a comprehensive, community services base to prevention, the following information was reviewed and considered by our committee:

- 1. Prior police reports involving the victim and suspect.
- 2. Department of Children and Families referrals against victim or suspect.
- 3. Shelter services, hotline contact. Safe Choices Class, and Court Advocacy utilized by victim or suspect.
- 4. All injunctions involving victim and suspect and any injunctions, which list victim or suspect as respondent.
  - 5. Criminal record of victim and suspect.
- 6. State Attorney files involving victim and suspect including any medical records in previous domestic or homicide files.
- 7. Batterer's intervention program participation, including performance, completion, violations and victim contact.
- 8. All dockets from prior domestic violence incidents and check juvenile records of children listed.
  - 9. HARK Attendance by children of victim and/or suspect.
  - 10. Animal abuse or neglect complaints.

### **ORDER OF EXAMINATION**

# I. <u>CRIME</u>

- 1. Relationship of parties
- 2. Facts

# II. CRIMINAL RECORDS AND REPORTS

- 1. Domestic violence reports and records
- 2. Non-domestic violent crimes
- 3. Substance abuse arrests
- 4. Juvenile arrests of dependents

### III. CIVIL

- 1. Domestic Violence Injunctions
- 2. Department of Children and Families Referrals; and Baker/Meyers Act commitment.

### IV. SERVICES

- 1. Shelter Services/Hotline calls
- 2. HARK attendance
- 3. Batterer's intervention program (Hubbard House/Salvation Army)
- 4. Substance Abuse program.

### V. OTHER CONCERNS

**Date of Murder: 12/04/97** 

Victim:

White/Female, 23

Suspect:

White/Male, 20

١.

A. Relationship: Wife/Husband (cohabitants)

### B. Facts:

The victim was found dead inside a concrete sewer tank. A concrete block was tied to her waist and her hands and feet were handcuffed. There was a sock stuffed into her mouth and duct tape was wrapped around her face. The victim's husband subsequently confessed to stabbing the victim during an argument and dumping her body. Cause of death was stab wound in chest and suffocation.

There was an infant child in this family but it is unknown if child was present at the time of murder. The couple had separated before. Marijuana and drug paraphernalia found in the residence. Arrest/case pending.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

N/A

The victim had reported a burglary six weeks before her murder. Items reported stolen included clothing and personal hygiene items.

#### III. CIVIL

There was a Children and Families referral in 1997 concerning suspect.

### IV. SERVICES

Victim had spoken to Hubbard House court advocate by phone.

Date of Murder: 12/31/97

Victim:

Black male, 37

Suspect:

White female, 44

1.

A. Relationship: Boyfriend/Girlfriend (cohabitants)

B. Facts:

The victim was found dead with a single stab wound to the neck/collar bone area. Witnesses stated that the two had been drinking and arguing all day. Early that morning the argument became heated and involved physical violence. The suspect armed herself with a knife and stabbed the victim once in the neck. The case was not filed after a review of all evidence and declared "justifiable."

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

#### A. Domestic Violence

(i) Victim:

Battery (Domestic Violence) 6/8/89: Victim, his girlfriend, was beaten with a stick; Adjudicated guilty, two days jail and six months probation sentenced to a counseling program, violated probation by failure to attend counseling and other conditions.

Battery (Domestic Violence) 5/25/92: Victim, his wife, was punched in the face and thrown down steps; Six months probation.

Aggravated Battery 1/21/96: Victim, his step-daughter, was shot two times in the hand during an argument

(ii) Suspect:

Aggravated Battery (Domestic Violence) 7/25/92: Victim, step-son, was struck on the leg with a golf club.

### B. Non-Domestic Violent Crimes:

(i) Victim:

Armed Sexual Battery; Armed Kidnapping; Sexual Battery w/Deadly Weapon, 9/13/89. Victim, 25 year old black female pedestrian, was abducted by gun point, beaten and repeatedly raped.

### C. Substance Abuse arrests:

(i) Victim:

Disorderly Intoxication 9/2/89

Possession of Crack Cocaine 9/4/96

- (ii) Suspect:
- Possession of a Controlled Substance and Possession of Drug
   Paraphernalia 2/22/93
- Possession of Drug Paraphernalia 8/6/93; 1/29/95; 8/14/96; 4/4/98
- Possession of Crack Cocaine w/Intent to Sell 2/18/94
- Sale of Crack Cocaine 8/23/95
- Inmate of a Disorderly House and Possession of a Controlled Substance 8/14/96
- Consumption of Alcohol/City Premises 4/4/98

### III. CIVIL

N/A

### IV. SERVICES

Victim:

Ordered as part of his probation for 6/8/89 Domestic Violence Battery to complete a generic counseling program.

### V. OTHER CONCERNS

Both victim and suspect had substance abuse problems. Alcohol played roll in killing, yet no substance abuse treatment ordered. No batterers intervention program ever ordered for victim although he had three arrests for domestic violence and another serious violent crime against a woman.

Date of Murder: 12/31/97

Victim:

Black/Male, 46

Suspect:

Black/Male, 24

١.

- A. Relationship: Father/Son (cohabitants)
- B. Facts:

The family became concerned when they learned that the victim failed to report for work. They went to his house and discovered the son, suspect, loading his belongings into his father's truck. The family became suspicious and called the police. The victim was found dead on his bed with a shotgun wound to the neck. Upon further investigation it was found that the suspect made threats to kill his father before this event. Arrested/case pending.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

- A. Non-Domestic Violent Crimes
  - (i) Victim:

Making Threats 12/8/72

(ii) Suspect:

Attempted Suicide, 8/5/97

Suspect Baker Acted 8/5/97

IV. SERVICES

N/A

V. <u>OTHER CONCERNS</u>

Prior unreported threats to kill father; access to loaded firearm with mental health history.

Date of Murder: 2/14/98

Victim (1):

Asian/Female, 27

Victim (2):

Asian/Male, 27

Suspect:

Asian/Male, 36

I.

A. Relationship: Wife/Lover/Estranged Husband

### B. Facts:

On February 14, 1998, Valentine's Day, the victims were found shot to death in the apartment of victim #1. Witnesses indicated that victim #1's estranged husband, who was barred from the property by a domestic violence injunction, was seen just after 12:45 A.M. entering the apartment and leaving a short time later. The suspect was found by patrol the next morning, interviewed and later booked for two counts of Murder. The victims were dating at the time of the murder. The victims were found by three small children who were in the apartment when the murders occurred.

Suspect told inmate while incarcerated and apartment office personnel the day before shooting that he planned to shoot the victims. Neither party reported this to law enforcement until after the homicide.

Suspect went to apartment complex 1/13/98 but not to apartment. Police called. Officer determined there was no violation of injunction. Case pending.

### I. <u>CRIMINAL RECORD</u>

#### A. Domestic Violence

### (i) Suspect:

Battery (Domestic Violence) 3/19/94: Beat wife (victim #1) with an iron rod. Suspect convicted and ordered to pay \$750.00 court costs.

Battery (Domestic Violence) 2/9/97: Choking, kicking victim #1, convicted. Received 10 days jail, six months probation, special conditions of 8 hour anger management course.

Battery (Domestic Violence) 1/14/98 and Battery: Victim #1 and another female victim. Suspect had been drinking. Convicted and ordered to 30 days jail, credited with time served.

### (ii) Victim #1:

a. Battery (Domestic Violence) 12/28/97 against suspect. Charged with hitting him in the face. Officer saw no marks. Above suspect was locked in victim #1's apartment and she was hacking a window screen with a meat cleaver. Police noted at least two calls to residence by responding officer for prior verbal arguments.

### III. CIVIL

- A. Victim #1 sought and was granted temporary injunction 1/16/98. Met with Hubbard House court advocate with translator present.
- B. Two prior HRS referrals on victim #1

### IV. <u>SERVICES</u>

- A. Victim #1 entered Hubbard House with children after 3/19/94 battery. Victim spoke limited English.
- B. 1997 suspect completed anger control classes (8 hrs) after 10 day jail sentence.
- C. Victim #1 met with Hubbard House court advocate with translator present, re: 1/98 injunction.
- D. HARK ordered for two children after murder.

### V. OTHER CONCERNS

State standards and leading experts all agree that marriage counseling or anger management is not appropriate intervention when domestic violence is present. A State certified batterer's intervention program through either Hubbard House or Salvation Army was not ordered with any of the three domestic violence convictions. Even after the third conviction, defendant only received 30 days time served. The victims and suspect had limited English.

Date of Murder: 3/30/98 Date of Suicide: 3/30/98

Victim:

White/Female, 56

Suspect:

White/Male, 60

I.

A. Relationship: Husband/Wife (cohabitants)

B. Facts:

The victim was found dead inside her residence by her adult son and his girlfriend. The victim had been shot twice in the back. The victim's husband was found dead at work with a self-inflicted gunshot wound to the head on the same date. The murder weapon, a .38 caliber revolver which was owned by the husband, was found at the scene of the suicide. It was later found that the victim and suspect frequently argued and were having marital problems.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

N/A

III. CIVIL

N/A

IV. SERVICES

N/A

### V. OTHER CONCERNS

According to the son, "He knew his father owned several handguns and rifles...and that his father appeared to be in an agitated mood...something like this would happen because of the volatile relationship that had been going on between his parents for several years."

Date of Murder: 05/20/98

Victim:

Black/Female, 48

Suspect:

Black/Male, 51

I.

A. Relationship: Estranged Wife/Husband (non-cohabitants)

B. Facts:

On April 25, 1998, the victim was shot numerous times by her estranged husband. The victim was ambushed by the suspect in the early morning hours as she left for work. The couple had been married for 14 years before the victim left him. At the time of the shooting they had been separated for two months. The victim died three weeks later. The day prior to the shooting the suspect came to the residence where the victim was at in violation of a pending domestic violence injunction. While present he made threats to kill the victim and other family members. During the shooting the victim's adult daughter, son-in-law and grandchildren were in the house. As he was leaving, the defendant fired shots into the dwelling.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

- A. Non-Domestic Violent Crimes:
  - (i) Suspect:

Robbery, 1964

Burglary, 1968

Rape, 1972: Received sentence of 101 years in prison, paroled 10/5/82.

Aggravated Battery arrest in 1987 which appeared to be a failed robbery attempt.

### III. CIVIL

4/87 - Dissolution of Marriage filed - then dropped

4/1/98 - V filed Domestic Violence injunction against D

4/24/98 - V filed Violation of Injunction

# IV. <u>SERVICES</u>

Marriage counseling ordered by injunction court.

# V. <u>OTHER CONCERNS</u>

Injunction judge ordered no contact except through marriage counselor of their choice. Suspect served 1/10th of sentence for rape in 1972.

99DOMMOR.SD1 /arc/jmm

Date of Murder: 06/23/98 Date of Suicide: 6/23/98

Victim:

Black/Female, 23

Suspect:

Black/Male, 22

I.

A. Relationship: Girlfriend/Boyfriend (former cohabitants), child in common

B. Facts:

The victim was shot once in the head in her own residence by her boyfriend who then shot himself. The suspect was found lying next to the victim with an apparent self inflicted gunshot wound to the head. The victim and suspect were boyfriend/girlfriend and had recently broken up. The suspect had previously threatened to harm the victim and kill himself if the two of them could not remain boyfriend/girlfriend.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

A. Domestic Violence

(i) Victim:

Aggravated Assault on suspect with a knife 8/21/93. Case

dropped.

(ii) Suspect:

Aggravated Assault on victim with a gun 8/21/93. Case

dropped.

III. CIVIL

N/A

IV. SERVICES

N/A

V. <u>OTHER CONCERNS</u>

Suspect threatened to kill the Victim and himself prior to the murder.

Date of Murder: 08/26/98

Victim:

١.

Black/Male, 46

Suspect:

White/Female, 43

A. Relationship: Boyfriend/Girlfriend (cohabitants), child in common

B. Facts:

The couple had been living together for seven years. The suspect's 7 year old daughter also lived in the home and was a witness to this homicide. The victim and defendant had both been drinking gin and arguing while making plans to travel to Georgia to make funeral arrangements for the victim's mother who had recently died. The suspect retrieved a knife from the kitchen and stabbed the victim one time in his abdomen. The victim later died in the hospital.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD - REPORTS

#### A. Domestic Violence

(i) Victim: commits three domestic violence batteries on the suspect. The first was prosecuted, and he was sentenced to six months probation, anger control, and TASC in June of 1997.

Two subsequent arrests for domestic battery were filed and later dropped, one in April, 1998, and the other in August which was pending at the time of his death.

III. CIVIL

N/A

### IV. <u>SERVICES</u>

The suspect attended Safe Choice Class in 12/97 and 8/98 - she requested charges dropped in both cases.

Victim attended Anger Management in 1997.

### V. OTHER CONCERNS

Three batteries committed by victim, yet no batterer's intervention ordered, rather anger management ordered.

Date of Murder: 09/01/98

Victim:

Black/Male, 34

Suspect:

Black/Male, 34

I.

A. Relationship: Boyfriend/Boyfriend (cohabitants)

B. Facts:

The suspect called 911 and reported that he and his lover were involved in an argument and struggled over a gun, which resulted in the victim being shot in the chest accidentally. An eyewitness at the crime scene said the suspect retrieved the gun and pointed it at the victim and fired intentionally. The witness said the argument was over the victim coming home late.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

- A. Domestic Violence
  - (i) Suspect: Aggravated Battery, 1984 victim shot by suspect, case dropped after arrest, because both victim and defendant had weapons.

and the second of the second of the second

10/12/97, suspect reported complaint of criminal mischief by this victim. This occurred during a break-up.

III. CIVII

N/A

IV. SERVICES

N/A

# 98-10

Date of Murder: 09/01/98 Date of Suicide: 9/01/98

Victim:

White/Male, 48

Suspect:

White/Female, 44

ł.

A. Relationship: Brother/sister (cohabitants)

B. Facts:

The victim and the suspect argued over dirty dishes. The suspect shot the victim and shot and wounded the victim's girlfriend, who fled. The suspect shot herself when police arrived.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

A. Substance abuse and other

(i) Suspect:

Two non-violent felonies (drug related)

and the control of th

(ii) Victim:

Battery in Clay County, unknown if domestic

III. CIVIL

Suspect Baker Acted 4/25/98

IV. SERVICES

N/A

. V. OTHER CONCERNS

Suspect was alleged to have a long history of mental illness and substance abuse.

### 98-11

Date of Shooting Which Resulted in Murder: 10/07/98

Date of Suicide: 10/07/98

Victim:

White/Female, 15

Suspect:

White/Male, 40

1.

A. Relationship: Stepdaughter/Stepfather (cohabitants)

B. Facts:

The victim was shot by her stepfather in the abdomen with an assault rifle while trying to call 911, following a domestic dispute between the defendant and the victim's mother. Suspect had been drinking and had punched the mother several times. The suspect then shot himself in the head and died. The victim was transported to University Medical Center, where she died on 11/2/98.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

### A. Domestic

(i) Suspect:

Battery (Domestic Violence) - 8/6/98. Police called to verbal argument between suspect and wife. Suspect intoxicated. Police called a second time. Phone had been disconnected and power source to home shut off at pole. Officer feared further violence. Suspect arrested.

### B. Substance Abuse Arrests

Defendant had three prior arrests for DUI/DWI.

### III. <u>CIVIL</u>

10/24/97 Divorce - Suspect and victim's mother

### IV. SERVICES

9/9/98 - suspect enrolled in Hubbard House First Step batterer's intervention program and was terminated for failure to attend on 10/19/98.

### V. OTHER CONCERNS

The victim's mother had one arrest for domestic violence and one domestic violence report written against her in 1998.

Date of Murder: 11/11/98

Victim:

White/Female, 49

Suspect:

White/Male, 50

١.

A. Relationship: Wife/Husband (cohabitants)

B. Facts:

The victim and suspect are husband and wife. The brother of the victim responded to the residence when the suspect failed to show up for work. The suspect answered the door and stated he would not be going to work because he killed his wife. The brother then notified police. The victim was strangled by the suspect 8-10 hours prior to the arrival of police. The suspect was preparing to commit suicide and had written a note to family members. The suspect had already killed the family dog and cat and buried them in the backyard. The suspect gave a written confession. Arrest/pending prosecution.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

N/A

III. CIVIL

N/A

IV. <u>SERVICES</u>

N/A

V. <u>OTHER CONCERNS</u>

Killing of family pets

# 98-13

Date of Murder: 11/23/98 Date of Suicide: 11/24/98

Victim:

White/Female, 21

Suspect:

White/Male, 30

1.

A. Relationship: Wife/Husband (non-cohabitating)

B. Facts:

The victim, her 16 month old daughter, and her mother were driving in a car when they were forced off the road by the suspect. They argued and the suspect shot her once in the leg, then once in the head, in front of her mother and child. The next day, he shot himself when police responded to his residence.

### II. CRIMINAL RECORD

### A. Domestic Violence

(i) Suspect:

Battery/domestic violence 11/91, adjudication withheld 6 months probation anger control

Child abuse 1/98, burned baby's clothes, supplies, and victim's belongings, result of domestic dispute, charges dropped at victim's request.

A warrant for aggravated stalking was issued the day of the murder.

# III. CIVIL

Two prior injunctions issued against Suspect with different petitioners. One issued on 12/91 and one in 4/94.

May 28, 1996: Injunction issued on behalf of Victim against Suspect. Suspect ordered to attend First Step; violated for failure to enroll 10/96, Judge dismissed violation.

November 16, 1998	-	Temporary Injunction Issued
11/11	-	Victim reported sexual battery and threats against her life by Suspect
11/19	• •	Victim reported stalking by Suspect and that he stole her pager
11/21	-	Victim reported stalking and threats against her life at a bar, violation of the injunction

Victim reported stalking, threats against her life, and vandalism by Suspect's associate, violation of the injunction Final order entered.

### IV. <u>SERVICES</u>

Victim spoke to Hubbard House court advocate who explained the injunction process 2-3 times. Victim turned down offer by advocate to accompany her to court hearing.

### V. <u>OTHER CONCERNS</u>

Suspect ordered to Anger Control in 1991.

# **1997 PATTERNS**

# (See Appendix A for Case Summaries)

### **GENDER**

Six of the homicides were committed by women who killed their male partners. Two were committed by men who killed their female partners. One was committed by an adult male who killed his parents.

### RACE

Six of the victims were black; four were white; seven of the suspects were black; two were white.

### RELATIONSHIP

Three of the parties were married and cohabitating at the time of the homicide; three were non-married partners who were not currently cohabitating; two were non-married partners cohabitating, one was an adult man and his parents, thus non-intimate partners.

#### METHOD

Five of the homicides were the result of gunshot wounds. Three of the homicides were the result of stab wounds, one victim died as the result of strangulation and one victim died of a heart attack during the crime.

### CRIMINAL HISTORY

Four male victims had prior arrests for domestic violence. One male suspect had a prior arrest for domestic violence. Additionally, four male victims were named as suspects in other domestic violence police reports.

No females had arrest records for domestic violence, but one female suspect was named as the suspect in a domestic violence report.

# CHILDREN

Children were eyewitnesses to two of the murders. In one other murder, a one year old child was present in the home.

### CHILD ABUSE REFERRALS

One family had an HRS referral for child neglect before the murder.

### SHELTER SERVICES

None of the victims used local shelter services.

HARK

No children attended the HARK Program.

### INJUNCTIONS

In the nine domestic homicides, one female suspect filed a prior injunction against the victim.

### INTERVENTION

Three male victims were ordered into batterer's intervention program and one appears to have completed the program. No male suspects were ordered into a batterer's intervention program and thus none completed one.

# 1998 PATTERNS

### **GENDER**

Seven of the homicides were committed by men who killed their female partners. During one of these homicides, the man also killed his wife's boyfriend. Two of the homicides were committed by women who killed their male partners. One man killed his same sex partner. One man killed his father. One man killed his stepdaughter during a fight with his wife. One woman killed her brother. Four of the men subsequently killed themselves as did one of the women.

### RACE

Six of the victims were black, six were white, and two of the victims were Asian. Eight of the suspects were white, four of the suspects were black, and one of the suspects was Asian.

### RELATIONSHIP

Three of the parties were married and cohabitating. Three of the parties were married and separated. Two of the parties were not married and cohabitating. One of the parties was not married and currently not cohabitating. Three of the parties were in a non-intimate relationship.

### **METHOD**

Ten of the homicides were the result of gunshot wounds. Three were the result of knife wounds. One was the result of strangulation.

### CHILDREN

Five of the cases had children present during the homicide, one additional case involved an infant who may or may not have been present.

### CRIMINAL HISTORY

Two male victims had prior arrests for domestic violence; four male suspects had prior arrests for domestic violence. Additionally, one male victim and one male suspect were named as suspects in other domestic violence police reports.

Three female victims had prior arrests for domestic violence; two female suspects had prior arrests for domestic violence.

# INJUNCTIONS

In the 13 domestic homicides, three of the female victims had injunctions in place during the murder. Two of them had reported violations in these existing injunctions. One of the aforementioned victims had a separate injunction two and one-half years prior to her death which resulted in the suspect being violated with the court dismissing the case because the victim failed to appear.

# **CHILD ABUSE REFERRALS**

Two families had referrals to the Department of Children and Families.

### SHELTER SERVICES

One female victim received shelter and court advocacy. Two additional female victims sought court advocacy services. One female suspect went through the Safe Choices class twice.

### **HARK**

In one case the children were referred to HARK.

### INTERVENTION

One male suspect was ordered to a batterer's intervention program two years prior to the murder, he was violated for failure to enroll. Another male suspect was ordered to a batterer's intervention program in the month preceding the murder. Other intervention was ordered as follows: one suspect, was ordered into marriage counseling as part of an injunction. One male victim had been ordered into generic counseling for a previous Domestic Battery. Three male victims were previously ordered as part of an earlier domestic violence case to attend Anger Control.

99DOMMOR SD1 /arcfirmm Page 28

# PATTERNS TO DATE (1997 - 1998)

### GENDER

Nine of the homicides were committed by men who killed their female partners. During one of these homicides, the man also killed his wife's boyfriend. Eight of the homicides were committed by women who killed their male partners. One man killed his same sex partner. Three men and one woman killed non-intimate partners. Four of the men subsequently killed themselves as did one of the women.

#### RACE

Twelve of the victims were black. Nine of the victims were white. Two of the victims were Asian. Ten of the suspects were white. Eleven of the suspects were black. One suspect was Asian.

### RELATIONSHIP

Six of the parties were married and cohabitating. Three of the parties were married and separated. Four of the parties were not married and cohabitating. Four of the parties were not married and currently not cohabitating. Four of the parties were in a non-intimate relationship.

### .METHOD

Fifteen of the homicides were the result of gunshot wounds. Six were the result of knife wounds. Two were the result of strangulation. One died of a heart attack during the crime.

### CHILDREN

Eight of the cases had children present during the homicide. One additional case involved an infant who may or may not have been present.

### CRIMINAL HISTORY

Six male victims had prior arrests for domestic violence. Five male suspects had prior arrests for domestic violence. Additionally, one male victim and one male suspect were named as suspects in other domestic violence police reports.

Three female victims had prior arrests for domestic violence. Two female suspects had prior arrests for domestic violence.

### **INJUNCTIONS**

In the 22 domestic homicides, three of the female victims had injunctions in place during the murder, one had a prior injunction. Two of them had reported violations in the existing injunctions. One of the aforementioned victims had a separate injunction two and one-half years prior to her death which resulted in the suspect being violated with the court dismissing the case because the victim failed to appear.

### CHILD ABUSE REFERRALS

Three families had referrals to the Department of Children and Families.

### SHELTER SERVICES

One female victim received shelter and court advocacy. Two additional female victims sought court advocacy. One female suspect went through the Safe Choices class twice.

### HARK

In one case the children were referred to HARK.

# INTERVENTION

One male suspect was ordered into a batterer's intervention program two years prior to the murder. He was violated for failure to enroll. Another male suspect was ordered into a batterer's intervention program the month preceding the murder. Three male victims were ordered into a batterer's intervention program as a result of domestic violence arrests. Other intervention was ordered as follows: One suspect was ordered into marriage counseling as part of an injunction. One male victim was ordered into generic counseling for a previous Domestic Battery. Three male victims were previously ordered as part of earlier domestic violence cases to attend Anger Control.

# CONCLUSIONS

Research on women who kill their intimate partners demonstrates how the majority are driven to such violence as a final act of self preservation. The majority of women who kill their abusers do so in self defense or the defense of their children.

In this study, eight women killed their male partners. In seven of the cases, those women had a history of victimization by their partners.

Men who kill their intimate female partners usually do so as the culmination of a long-standing battering relationship. There were eight cases where men killed their female partners. Five of these followed a history of domestic violence.

Homicide-suicide involves the killing of one or more persons followed soon thereafter by the suicide of the perpetrator. There were five local cases that involved homicide-suicides.

National trends show that female and male offenders in domestic homicides are usually either equal in numbers or the men outnumber women as the killer. In the homicides involving intimate partners, ten were committed by men and eight were committed by women.

Men killed by other men are usually involved in a relationship with a victimized woman.

One case followed this pattern. In addition, one involved a same sex intimate relationship and two involved sons who killed their fathers.

Our review of these 22 domestic homicides revealed that not enough victims took advantage of existing social services and legal remedies.

Although we have a system which provides for civil injunctions, only four female victims had current or past injunctions. Three of those victims had reported violations.

Furthermore, there were eight cases where children were present and observed the murder of a parent. Only one received a court referral into the innovative HARK program.

Finally, state standards and leading experts all agree that marriage counseling or anger management is not appropriate intervention when violence is present. A state certified batterer's intervention program is statutorily recommended in domestic violence cases.

Of these 22 domestic homicides, 13 of the parties had a history of domestic violence, yet only five were ordered into batterer's intervention programs and only one completed the course. Five men were ordered into generic counseling or anger management instead of a certified batterer's intervention program.

# **RECOMMENDATIONS**

This committee recognizes that further study is needed to generate a statistically valid sample. It recommends that the membership of the committee remain static and produce a 1999 report. The committee also recommends that certified Batterers' Intervention Programs be ordered more often in criminal and civil domestic violence cases and that anger management or general counseling should not be substituted for a certified batterers' intervention program.

9900MMOR SD1 /arc/jmm Page 34

A HARAN TO THE REST OF THE MATERIAL TO A STATE OF THE AREA AND A STATE OF THE

# APPENDIX A BRIEF SUMMARIES

The following is a brief summary of each domestic homicide.

### **Base Study:**

This homicide occurred on 01/27/96. The victim, a 31 year old black female, was shot and killed by her estranged husband, a 32 year old black male. The offender was a police officer in another city. There was a prior history of domestic violence. The offender had committed a battery on the victim after she separated from him the week prior to the murder. The victim had an Injunction for Protection against the offender at the time of her death. The victim had four children. Three were school age at the time of the murder. The victim and her children had recently moved from Daytona Beach to Jacksonville. The offender resided in Daytona. The youngest child was the child of both the victim and the offender. None of the children witnessed the homicide. The offender threatened suicide after he committed the murder, but he was taken into custody by the Daytona Beach Police SWAT team before he harmed himself.

The children are now living with the maternal grandparents in another state.

The offender had been arrested previously for an Aggravated Assault and later was found not guilty after a jury trial in another city in Florida.

#### Case A:

This homicide occurred on January 17, 1997. The victim, a 25 year old black male, was stabbed to death by his girlfriend, a 21 year old black female, during an argument at the victim's residence. The victim and the offender were not living together at the time of the murder and had no children.

The victim in this case had an outstanding capias for Violation of Probation for a charge of Domestic Battery on his offender. The sentence he had initially received was four months probation, Batterer's Intervention Program, and no <u>violent</u> contact with the victim. The victim also had several misdemeanors involving non-violent crimes on his record. The offender had no record. There were past police reports by the offender written in 1993, 1994 and 1996.

# **APPENDIX A**

There were no past or current injunctions filed by either party at the time of the murder.

### Case B:

This homicide occurred on March 1, 1997. The victim, a 38 year old black male, was shot by his live-in partner, a 37 year old black female, during an argument at their residence. There were no children present during the homicide.

The victim had a record of several non-violent misdemeanors. The offender had a record of one violent misdemeanor.

There were no current or past Injunctions filed by either party at the time of the homicide.

### Case C:

This homicide occurred on March 8, 1997. The victims were killed by their adult son. There were no current or past Injunctions for Protection filed by any of the parties. The victims had no criminal record.

### Case D:

This homicide occurred on March 26, 1997. The victim, a 45 year old white male, was shot and killed by his wife, a 34 year old white female, at their residence. The offender's 14 year old son was present in the home when the murder occurred. The homicide occurred after the victim told the offender he was leaving her and moving in with his girlfriend. The couple had been married for seven years.

The victim had a prior history of domestic violence on the offender. The offender had filed an Injunction for Protection on the victim in 1995. The victim had a record of two Domestic Batteries, 1991, and 1995, committed on the offender. He also had out of county arrests for

# APPENDIX A

Kidnapping, Aggravated Assault, and Battery. The victim was sentenced both times to probation with Batterer's Intervention Program. He attended Hubbard House First Step Program from April, 1995 through October, 1995. The assessment from Hubbard House states he had a drinking problem in his past. The victim had two police reports written for domestic violence in 1997 prior to his murder.

Their child is now in custody of Department of Children and Families and is living at a residential drug treatment program.

### Case E:

This homicide occurred on March 31, 1997. The victim, a 50 year old black male, was stabbed to death by his girlfriend, a 35 year old black female, at her residence. The victim and offender were not living together at the time of the murder and no children were involved in the incident.

The victim had a record for Stalking on the offender in 1994. He received a suspended sentence and a fine. The offender had a record of two non-violent misdemeanors and one non-violent felony. The offender had an HRS referral for child abuse and neglect in 1995 that was classified unfounded. Her son is now a victim of neglect by his natural father who has custody because offender is incarcerated.

There were no current or past Injunctions filed by either party at the time of the murder.

### Case F:

This homicide occurred on May 18, 1997. The victim, a 25 year old white male, was shot and killed by his wife, a 25 year old black female, in their residence. The couple's one-year old female child was present in their home at the time of the murder.

The victim was a convicted felon and had a record of several Worthless Check charges and Auto Theft. The offender had no record.

There were no current or past Injunctions filed by either party at the time of the murder.

# **APPENDIX A**

The parents were listed as suspects in a 1996 HRS referral for child neglect due to drug use in the home. The case was closed without any action taken. The children now live with the offender's mother.

### Case G:

This homicide occurred on October 18, 1997. The victim, a 36 year old black disabled female, was shot and killed by her 36 year old black male husband. Her husband had become angry and jealous over a co-worker who was friends with the victim. Two young black female stepchildren of the victim witnessed the murder. They are presently living with grandparents.

There was a prior history of domestic violence by the offender on the victim. He was sentenced to a Batterer's Intervention Program in 1996 after committing a Battery on the victim. He also had convictions for Armed Robbery. There were no current or past Injunctions filed by either party. The victim had a police report for domestic violence in 1997 prior to her murder.

### Case H:

This homicide occurred on October 23, 1997.

The victim, a 32 year old black male, was stabbed to death by his live-in partner, a 28 year old black female, at their residence. There were no children present. The victim and the offender had no criminal record. There were no current or past Injunctions filed by either party at the time of the murder. The victim had one prior police report for domestic violence in 1997.

### Case I:

The victim, a 35 year old black female, was shot and killed by her boyfriend, a 46 year old black male, in a convenience store parking lot. The offender has shot and killed his stepfather in 1994. He had several convictions for Armed Robbery. The victim had no criminal record. There were no children present. There were no current or past injunctions filed by either party at the time of the murder.

