Domestic Violence Death Review Statistics for 2001
OFFICIAL REPORT
DOMESTIC VIOLENCE DEATH REVIEW
STATISTICS for 2001

OFFICIAL REPORT

Each year, deaths attributable to domestic violence constitute a significant portion of the total number of homicides in San Joaquin County. As courts and communities try to confront domestic violence, the question of what to do about domestic violence fatalities continually resurfaces. Normally, these fatalities are handled by the criminal justice system, which investigates the deaths and identifies and charges the perpetrators when appropriate. Such criminal justice handling, however, does little to review the effectiveness of the various systems charged with servicing and protecting those vulnerable to domestic violence and death.

In October 2002, in an effort to examine and evaluate current policies and practices used by agencies and individuals working with victims and perpetrators in violent relationships, the San Joaquin County Domestic Violence Death Review Team was formed. The DVDRT is a multi-disciplinary team made up of a combination of various criminal justice, health, and social service agencies in San Joaquin County and is established pursuant to California Penal Code §11163.3. By conducting a formal review of all agency and criminal justice involvement in domestic violence deaths, domestic violence-related deaths and suicides, we are in a better position to understand why they happened so that strategies can be developed to improve the community’s ability to prevent such occurrences in the future.
MISSION STATEMENT
The purpose of the San Joaquin County Domestic Violence Death Review Team is to review circumstances leading up to domestic violence-related deaths. Our goal is to improve the response of public and private agencies to incidents of domestic violence, strengthen system policies and procedures, and identify prevention strategies to reduce future incidents of domestic violence-related injuries and deaths. In reviewing these cases, we will gather statistical data to determine how our local agencies can implement these goals.

CONFIDENTIALITY
The Team Members follow the guidelines set forth in California Penal Code section 11163.3. The Members will are required at the start of each meeting to sign a confidentiality form. The Chairperson of the D.V.D.R.T. shall disclose to the County Board of Supervisors and media ONLY STATISTICAL DATA at the end of each year. No names of victims, or any other information about cases reviewed shall be disclosed.

CASES TO BE REVIEWED:
The Domestic Violence Death Review Team only reviews cases in which the investigation, prosecution, and sentencing have been completed. If a case is still under investigation or in the court process, we wait until that process is completed before reviewing that case.

The Team reviews three types of cases:

1) DOMESTIC VIOLENCE HOMICIDES – Cases in which the homicide victim and perpetrator are married, engaged, dating, former dating, have a child together or formerly married.

2) DOMESTIC VIOLENCE RELATED HOMICIDES – Cases in which the homicide victim and perpetrator do not have the prior “amorous” relationship, however the gravamen of the offense involves “domestic violence situations”. (i.e. Old boyfriend kills new boyfriend.).

3) SUICIDES – All cases where the victim of the suicide had any history of prior domestic violence either as a perpetrator or a victim.

HOMICIDE BREAKDOWN
Total Homicides = 53.
Domestic Violence = 4 out of the 53.
Domestic Violence Related = 6 out of the 53
2001 HOMICIDE BREAKDOWN:
San Joaquin County suffered 53 homicides.
- Stockton – 31 homicides
- County (including Lathrop) – 20 homicides
- Manteca – 1 homicide
- Lodi – 1 homicide
- Tracy – 0
- Ripon – 0
- Escalon – 0

DOMESTIC VIOLENCE HOMICIDES = 4
There were four (4) separate Domestic Violence homicides in 2001. In each case there was only one victim.
- Stockton – 3 D.V. homicides cases
- County – 1 D.V. homicide case

DOMESTIC VIOLENCE RELATED HOMICIDES = 6
There were three (3) Domestic Violence related homicide cases in 2001. One case resulted in 4 homicide victims. The other 2 cases resulted in 1 homicide victim each.
- Stockton – 1 D.V. related homicide case
- County – 2 D.V. related homicide cases

2001 SUICIDE BREAKDOWN
There were 53 Suicides in the County in 2001. Two (2) suicide victims had previously been victims of Domestic Violence. (Neither suicide involved a Domestic Violence situation.)

Seven (7) suicide victims had previously been Domestic Violence offenders.

There was one Domestic Violence murder/suicide, where the perpetrator of the homicide then killed himself. (In that case the murder was committed within S.J.C. but the suicide was committed outside of the county.)

There was one (1) Domestic Violence related murder/suicide where the perpetrator of the homicide then committed suicide.

2001 DOMESTIC VIOLENCE HOMICIDE STATISTICS:
Four (4) Homicides

Ages:
Victims – 25 to 42 years old
Average – 28.2 years of age
Perpetrators – 23 to 43 years old
Average – 34.5 years of age

Race:
Victims
Caucasian – 1
Hispanic – 1
Pacific Islander – 2

Perpetrators
Pacific Islander – 1
Asian – 1
Hispanic – 2

Prior Criminal Records:
Victims – 1
Perpetrator – 1

Probation/Parole Status:
Victim – None on probation or parole at the time of the offense
Perpetrators – Only 1 was on parole at the time of the offense

SUICIDE BREAKDOWN
Total Suicides = 53
Domestic Violence Related = 1

[Diagram showing]
Prior Domestic Violence History:

Reported – In 2 out of 4 cases the homicide victims had prior “Law Enforcement” documented history of being a victim of Domestic Violence. However, one of the two the victim’s prior perpetrator was NOT the perpetrator of the current crime.

Unreported – In 2 cases the homicide victim had a prior unreported history of Domestic Violence with the current perpetrator.

Relationship:

Married – 2 out of 4.
The other 2 cases the victim & perpetrator were NOT living together but did have children together.

Children:

All 4 cases the victim & perpetrator had children together.

In 2 of the cases children witnessed some part of the current crime.

Injuries – None of the children were injured.

Third Party Injuries:

None of the cases involved injuries to third parties.

Restraining Orders:

In only 1 case was a R.O. in effect at the time of the homicide, and in that case the R.O. had been in effect for several years.

Nationality:

Victims – 3 out 4 of were US citizens.
Perpetrators – 3 out of 4 were US citizens.
The fourth victim and perpetrator were Mexican Nationals.

Language:

Victims – 2 out of 4 spoke English as their first language or fluently.
Perpetrators – 2 out of 4 spoke English as their first language or fluently.

In the other cases the individuals spoke Spanish and Tagalog.

Substance Abuse:

In none of the cases, by either the victim or perpetrator, was substance abuse an issue in the homicide.

Sex:

Victims – All 4 were female.
Perpetrators – All 4 were male.

Manner of Death/Weapon:

- 2 firearms (handguns)
- 1 strangulation.
- 1 nail gun

In the firearms cases the perpetrator illegally possessed a gun.

Murder/Suicide:

Only 1 case involved a domestic violence/murder suicide and the suicide was committed outside of the county several days later.

Location:

In 3 out of 4 cases the victims were murdered in their own home.

In the other case the victim was kidnapped and murdered in a remote location of the county.

None were committed in the workplace.

- Stockton – 3 D.V. homicide case
- County – 1 D.V. homicide cases

Evidence of Prior Mental Health:

Victims – None had a prior history of reported mental health problems.
Perpetrators – Only 1 out of 4 had a prior reported history of mental health problems.
2001 DOMESTIC VIOLENCE HOMICIDE STATISTICS (cont'd.):

Prior Domestic Violence Counseling:
Victims – Only 1 out of 4 had received prior victim counseling.
Perpetrators – Only 1 out of 4 had received prior Domestic Violence perpetrator counseling.

Time in the County:
Only 1 victim and 1 perpetrator were lifelong residents of S.J.C.
Less than 15 years – Only 1 victim and 1 perpetrator
Less than 10 years – Only 1 victim and 1 perpetrator
Less than 5 years – Only 1 Victim and 1 perpetrator

Resolutions:
One case was murder/suicide.
Two (2) perpetrators are serving life sentences.
One perpetrator is serving 16 years in prison because the case was a “heat of passion” crime.
Three out of the four cases were PREMEDITATED MURDER.

2001 DOMESTIC VIOLENCE RELATED HOMICIDES:
Six (6) D.V. Related Homicides

Ages:
Victims – 4 years old to 48 years old
Average – 18.5 years old
Perpetrators – 18 years old to 49 years old
Average – 36.3 years old

Race:
Victims
Caucasian – 4
Hispanic – 1
Asian – 1
Perpetrators
African American – 1
Hispanic – 1
Caucasian – 1

Prior Criminal Records:
Victim – 1 (misdemeanor non D.V.)
Perpetrators – All 3 had prior records

Probation / Parole Status:
Victims – None on probation or parole at the time of the offense
Perpetrators – 2 were felons on probation at the time of the offense

Prior Domestic Violence History:
Reported – None
Non-Reported – Only 1 case

Relationships:
In two (2) cases the perpetrator was the ex-boyfriend of a relative of the victim
Two (2) of the victims were the mothers of the perpetrators ex-girlfriend
Three (3) of the victims were the children of the perpetrators ex-girlfriend
In one (1) case the victim was the ex-boyfriend and the perpetrator was new boyfriend
### 2001 Domestic Violence Related Homicides (cont’d.):

**Children:**
- Victims: 3 children
- Witnesses: 2 children

**Third Party Injuries:**
- There were 6 other people injured and 2 of them were minors, but none of these injuries were fatal.

**Restraining Orders:**
- None of the cases involved a current or former restraining order.

**Nationality:**
- Everyone was a U.S. citizen

**Language:**
- All victims & perpetrators spoke English

**Substance Abuse:**
- In only one case was there evidence of substance abuse and the substance was alcohol.

**Sex:**
- **Victims**
  - Female: 4
  - Male: 2
- **Perpetrators**
  - Male: 3

**Manner of Death / Weapon:**
- 3 – firearms (handguns)
- 2 – stabbing (knife)
- 1 – baseball bat
- In the firearms cases the perpetrator illegally possessed a gun.

**Murder / Suicide:**
- Only 1 case involved murder suicide

**Location:**
- Stockton – 1 case.
- County – 2 cases in the County.
- All occurred in the victims’ homes.

---

**Evidence of Prior Mental Health:**
- No evidence that any of the victims and/or the perpetrators had any prior mental health problems.

**Prior Domestic Violence Counseling:**
- There was no evidence that any of the victims, perpetrators, or families had received any domestic violence counseling as either victims of domestic violence or perpetrators.

**Time in County:**
- **Victims**
  - Lifetime: 5
  - Not from County: 1
- **Perpetrators**
  - Lifetime: 2
  - Less than 5 years: 1

**Resolutions:**
- One case was a multiple murder/suicide, and the murders were premeditated.
- One case was not prosecuted because of self-defense issues.
- One perpetrator was convicted and is serving 29 years in state prison, and the murder was a heat of passion crime.
RECOMMENDATIONS

In addition to reviewing the cases (Domestic Violence Homicides, Domestic Violence Related Homicides, and Suicides) and compiling statistics, the D.V.D.R.T. also formulates recommendations for implementation which are designed to prevent Domestic Violence Homicides.

After careful review of the 2001 year the D.V.D.R.T. has made the following recommendations with respect to two areas. The First area is our Investigation of the cases we review. The Second area is the outreach within our own agencies and the community, in which we will implement the D.V.D.R.T.’s suggestions and recommendations.

INVESTIGATION

In the next year the D.V.D.R.T. will investigate the Victim’s workplace to see what if anything his/her co-workers knew about any domestic violence. The D.V.D.R.T. found in the investigation of the 2001 cases that many times there may be warning signs in the workplace of domestic violence which has occurred in the home.

In the next year we will contact the surviving family members of the Victim for any information they may have regarding the Victim’s relationship. This area is important to determine if there was a history of D.V. that was not reported to any agencies.

OUTREACH

The Team Members through their Agencies will contact and access members of the Business Community to provide training and awareness on Domestic Violence.

Team Members will continue outreach into the many new cultures within our community to provide Domestic Violence Awareness.

Team Members will translate the current Domestic Violence Awareness literature into many more dialects.

Team Members will coordinate with local schools to teach Domestic Violence Awareness to the children of our community. These trainings will take place in high school and colleges.
WE WOULD LIKE TO THANK ALL OF THE FOLLOWING PARTICIPATING INDIVIDUALS & AGENCIES:

Griselda Alberto
San Joaquin County Probation

Yvonne Arrell, R.N.
Director of Education

Diane Bates
Witness
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

Gary Benincasa
Ladt Police Department

Steve Boerman
Marlata Police Department

Hilda Bohacek
Child Abuse Prevention Council

Anna Castro
Family Crimes Unit
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

Toni Cecchetti
Family Law Center

Sgt. Ralph Colin
Marlata Police Department

Kay Corsun
San Joaquin County Mental Health

Sgt. Dennis Cunningham
Ladt Police Department

Dawn Custer
San Joaquin County Public Health Services

Becky DalPorto
Valley Community Counseling

Jeffrey Derman
Deputy District Attorney
Family Crimes Unit
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

Mr. David Duley
Deputy District Attorney Investigator
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office of Investigation

David Erb
Chief Protection Services Division Chief

Lt. John Espinoza
Tracy Police Department

Sgt. Bill Fellers
Sheriff's Office
San Joaquin County Sheriff's Department

Carolyn Fisher
San Joaquin County Office of Education

Heather Fontes
Career & Stockton Supervision Supervisor
San Joaquin County Adult Probation

Ms. Sandi Gaarder
Office of the Attorney General of California Crime and Prevention Center

Dr. Laura Gabriele
Kaiser Permanente

Lt. Tom Gaumer
Stockton Police Department

Kate Gerliach
Dawn House-Women's Center

Joelle Gomez
Women's Center

Betsy Green
District Attorney Investigations
San Joaquin District Attorney's Office of Investigation

Dep. Tina Guerrero
Coroner's Office
San Joaquin County Sheriff's Department

Susan Guzman
Probation Unit Supervisor
San Joaquin County Adult Probation

Deborah Hegwer
HSA/CPS

Margaret Hepburn
President
St. Dominic's Hospital

Marciann Hernandez, PHN
Public Health Services

Jill Hoagland, RN
Doctors Hospital of Manteca

Craig Holmes
Co-Chair Person San Joaquin County Domestic Violence Death Review Team
Chief Deputy District Attorney
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

James Johnson LCSW

Annette Kirby
San Joaquin County Superior Court

Lyn Kirkconnell
Catholic Charities Immigration Program

Diana Landman
San Joaquin County Superior Court

Julia Lee
Deputy District Attorney
Family Crimes Unit
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

Scott Lindsay
Ripon Police Department

David Love, Director
VICS

Joseph Marquette
Center for Positive Prevention Alternatives, Inc.

Linda Mascarenas
HSA/CPS

Lynn Matsumoto
HSA/CPS

Sandi May
San Joaquin County Superior Court

Patricia Mazzioli
Assistant Deputy Chief Probation Officer
San Joaquin County Probation Department

Kerry L. Miller, RN
Stuffer Tracy Community Hospital

Wendy Moore
Adult Protective Services

Lt. Thomas Morris
Stockton Police Department

Michael J. Mulvihill, Jr.
Co-Chair Person San Joaquin County Domestic Violence Death Review Team
Deputy District Attorney
Family Crimes Unit
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

Chief Wait Murken
Bakston Police Department

David Naumann
San Joaquin County Probation Department

Dennis Newlin
Director of Youth & Clinical Services
Center for Positive Prevention Alternatives, Inc. (CPPA)

John Occult
Mantata Police Department

Craig Pedrucci
HSA/CPS

Danielle Peirano
Deputy District Attorney
Family Crimes Unit
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

Mike Perez
HSA/CPS

Tim Polinsky
Juvenile Probation

Kenneth Puckett
Supervisor Family Crimes Unit
Deputy District Attorney
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

Joan Rameage
Adult Protective Services

Kristine M. Reed
Family Crimes Unit
Deputy District Attorney
San Joaquin County District Attorney's Office

Lyndee Riley
Central California Safety Council

Sheryl Roddy
Human Services Agency
Program Manager
CalWORKS Employment Center

Sherry Rufert
Dameon Hospital

Lynn Saga-Matsumoto
Human Services/Child Protective Services

Chief Thomas Scheidocker
Ripon Police Department

Lon Schiff-Ross, LCSW
San Joaquin County Superior Court

Mike Sims
Tracy Police Department

Sara Soleberg
St. Joseph's Hospital
Eddy Stankey
Adult Protective Services
SPECIAL THANKS TO THE FOLLOWING NON-MEMBERS FOR THEIR SPECIAL CONTRIBUTIONS TO THE TEAM:

Kristy Castro
Intern, Homicide Unit
San Joaquin County District Attorney’s Office

Robert Himelblau
Homicide Unit
Deputy District Attorney
San Joaquin County District Attorney’s Office

Charles Schultz
Supervising Deputy District Attorney
San Joaquin County District Attorney’s Office

Jeff Traverso
Deputy District Attorney
San Joaquin County District Attorney’s Office

Stephanie Watt
San Joaquin County Probation Dept.

Caryn Willett
Family Crimes Program Supervisor
San Joaquin County District Attorney’s Office

Parole Agent Lisa Zuniga
California State Parole

Ms. Wendy Tully
Office of the Attorney General of California
Crime and Prevention Center

Kristi Cunnigham
Intern, Family Crimes Unit
San Joaquin County District Attorney’s Office

Tracy Newhouse
Technical Services
San Joaquin County District Attorney’s Office